

Minutes of the 1st Annual Meeting between the CGIAR and the French research institutions

Wednesday 19 June 2013 : 14.00-17.30

Venue : Agropolis (Salle du conseil), Montpellier, France

1/Opening (by Bernard Hubert, CRAI chair):

Bernard Hubert welcomes all participants and reminds them that this meeting is planned in the framework of the Framework Agreements signed in March between the CGIAR Consortium and the French Research Organizations. The purpose is to take stock on the current collaborations between the CGIAR, in particular through the CRPs, and the French agricultural research for development and to assign objectives of progress for the coming year.

2/Introduction from French research institutions

On behalf of the French institutions, Patrick Caron expresses his happiness to introduce this first meeting between the reformed CGIAR and the French research institutions involved in ARD. He mentions several points of importance:

- France has supported the CGIAR reform since the beginning and appreciates the emphasis on partnership.
- The installation of the Consortium headquarters in Montpellier, France, has created new opportunities of collaborations that are really exciting from Cirad point of view.
- The international context is favorable to an increase in the collaboration. We should move from a position of competition, as it may have been in the past, to a situation where we join our forces to face the global challenges of food security, fight poverty and develop a sustainable and ecofriendly agriculture. Objectively we all have more to win in this new context.
- As public funded research entities, we share a lot of common topics and issues, though of course with some differences. In addition it is obvious that no one system alone is capable to address all the global issues to be tackled and for that reason there is an urgent need to join effort and resources.

From our point of view, a balanced cooperation should be based on 3 principles:

- Co-design
- Co-investment
- Co-governance.

On this basis we and especially Cirad are ready to contribute even more to this cooperation, in particular in the CRPs which are now the main entry point for collaboration though they are not the only one; there is a long standing tradition of collaboration by positioning scientists in the CG Centers from French institutions in particular from Cirad and IRD. We want to strengthen that, but other innovating mechanisms can also be used. For instance, there are opportunities to host CG scientist on our research platforms (in Montpellier, in the French overseas departments, or abroad on the partnership platforms co-established by Cirad/IRD with foreign partners).

For IRD, Dominique Dumet thanks Dr Caron for its introductory remarks fully reflecting IRD position. DD just adds that IRD is an Advanced Research Institute focusing on three research domains: Environment and Resources -which includes agriculture-, Health and Social Sciences. IRD activity is based on partnership with NARS, and its goal is to increase national capacity in research for development. IRD is willing to engage further with CGIAR via the CRPs, especially in capacity development and project development – In this matter the alignment of IRD tools especially joint international programs and CRPs is a subject of high interest for the institute that can be further discussed.

Andrée Sontot (INRA International relationships) stated that INRA is happy to participate to this first annual meeting between the CGIAR and the French research institutions. Wheat and Maize are currently the CRPs with which INRA principally has relations; although these CRPs could not be represented at this meeting today, she appreciate the opportunity she had to participate to their meetings with donors and external stakeholders on June 18th. These discussions, along with the ones of today, will contribute to the draft MoU we are working on, as planned in the Letter of Intent that the Consortium and INRA signed last March.

For the CGIAR Consortium, Frank Rijsberman welcomes the message that French partners want to strengthen their relationships with CGIAR. From the CG side, the installation of the Consortium Office in Montpellier raised some questions at the beginning. But now it is understood that there has been a strategic move from the French institutions towards the CGIAR and that creates opportunities to strengthen links between our two systems.

France has a different way of collaborating with the CGIAR system than other countries which are acting mainly as funder and not as “doers” said Frank. France’s contribution as a donor is small but French “in kind” contribution, through scientist assigned to Centers /CRPs, is large. Extending the recognition of this contribution to teams working outside the CG centers - on platforms based in France or abroad – requires a clear agreement on the research priorities and shared agenda. This is critical. It has been done in the case of GRISP with a strong commitment of Cirad and IRD in the implementation and even governance of the program. This mode of contribution could be used as an example for other partners that need to identify areas of potential contribution to specific CRPs (eg. Embrapa with cassava research,...). These 2 models of contribution (by direct funding or through jointly setting the research agenda as well as co-implementing it) are interesting and should be taken into consideration. French institutions can therefore help the CGIAR to design new ways of collaboration, which can be extended to non French partners. The CG Consortium and the French institutions Cirad/IRD/Inra can also explore other cross-cutting means of collaboration, such a joint post-doctoral program.

3/ CGIAR Research programs (CRPs) : review of the current involvement of French partners and ways to move forwards

3.1 Presentation of a case study / the CGIAR-France collaboration within CRP 6 Forests, Trees & Agroforestry/FTA (by Robert Nasi , FTA director)

Long history of collaboration between Cirad, IRD (and to some extent INRA) and the Centers (Cifor, Icrf and Bioversity) through joint project and scientist secondment.

Strong involvement of French teams from the beginning in the drafting of the CRP6 document (equivalent to 6 FTE - Cirad & IRD- through over 20 scientists dedicated to this work)

CRP 6 started in July 2011 with the development of an operational plan. At the beginning only French scientists (Cirad & IRD) were directly involved within preexisting joint projects (15 projects with portfolio of 9 Mn USD / year whether led by Cirad, IRD or Cifor). In 2012, CRP6 WP was updated, and Cirad & IRD are now contributing also with activities coherent with CRP6/FTA programming (eg. Congo basin activities) but not funded by CRP6.

Currently 18 French scientists (in FTE) are contributing fully to FTA (on a potential of 50 FTE), including 7/8 French scientists seconded to Centers: this is a very valuable contribution. The real added value of the French teams is greater than their contribution in research time as they also bring their own work into the basket. CATIE plans to do the same soon. Cirad is leading one of the sentinel landscapes (Tropical forest observatory) and is embarking new partners on the project (eg. Embrapa). Cirad is the first non CG member to be part of the CRP6 Steering Committee (3 are expected to join soon).

Pb identified: Lack of mechanisms to ease the transfer of fund between partners (CG-Non CG).

3.2 Review of French teams involvement in others CRPs

For each CRP: Short Presentation (1-3 slides) of the current involvement of French institutions as support for discussion (from their perspective) + 5mm discussions and perspectives.

CRP 1.1 Dryland systems (presentation by B. Hubert, Agropolis International and SC member)

- North and West Africa drylands as priority areas for joint research initiatives, considering that those areas are prioritized by Cirad, Inra and IRD.
- Bill Payne, Director of the Dryland Systems Program, highlighted French involvement in the development of this program, which was officially launched in April 2013. Now DS's agenda reorganized along 7 IDO (instead of SRT). Interest to develop joint KB activities.
- Contribution of French Institutions expected especially for North Africa and francophone Western Africa countries. Needs of French backstopping on CRP "weak" points: Farming system, modeling and innovation platform, in particular. See also about developing joint activities (on a complementary basis in West Africa).

- Because CRP Dryland Systems is one of the latest approved, it has just been launched a month ago and more collaboration will be identified soon. Anyway some are still working since several years, e.g. in Egypt where joint projects has illustrated how such collaborations could help for new fundraising from European commission or French agencies, as ANR or AIRD.

CRP 1.3 Aquatic Agricultural Systems (presentation by Ph. Vernier)

At Cirad fish farming research is operated by *Intrepid*, a Cirad-Ifremer joint research unit

- To date not connection between CRP 1.3 and French teams.
- But several themes of shared interest such as :
 - Sustainable system productivity, access to markets, Social-ecological resilience and adaptive capacity, Policies and institutions to empower AAS users
 - Geographical areas: Cote d'Ivoire, Benin, Cameroon, Rep of Guinea.

Patrick Dugan (director CRP AAS) indicates that AAS is more than fish but works on water dominated environments where farmers are combining several activities and need to adapt to changing conditions. Great interest to collaborate on innovation systems. Ongoing discussions on how to develop collaboration on cross-cutting issues.

AAS started activities on a very limited geographical areas but wants to expand, in SSA in particular.

Keen to engage with other institutions, including French partners, with a special interest on Innovative mechanisms to implement the program. Also interest on secondment of postdocs.

For the second phase (starting 2015), the management structure will be modified, opening opportunities for French institutions to participate.

CRP 2 : Policies, Institutions & Markets (PIM) : (presentation by P. Fabre, scientific Director at Cirad)

- Low level of collaboration on PIM issues in the past between Cirad & CGIAR.
- In the process of knowing each other.
- Discovering where we can collaborate based on complementarities and comparative advantages. 2 topics have been identified:
 - Methodology of data collection and analysis (with IFPRI).
 - Information sharing on livestock system in dryland Africa (collaboration with Harvest+).
- Not yet at the level of joint program or joint project.

For Karen Brooks (CRP PIM Director) much more can be done together. There are already some collaboration on foresight (complementarities to the quantitative modeling done by IFPRI); why not also on value chain, on safety nets and social protection issues, on sustainable intensification? Was also mentioned the interest to translate into English the Atlas on pastoralism in Africa (done by PPZS) and to see how the access to data used for this atlas could be facilitated.

CRP 3.3 GRiSP (presentation by A. Ghesquiere, IRD)

Strong investment of French institutions (Cirad & IRD) from the beginning. More than 80 French scientists involved + funding of several projects:

- Massive sequencing by **France-Genomic initiative**
- 4 research projects funded jointly by Agropolis Fondation and Cariplo (Italian foundation) on:
 - ✓ Genomic selection for resources use efficiency in rice
 - ✓ Evolution of reproductive development in the Oryza genus
 - ✓ Connecting biology on rice disease resistance, drought tolerance and flowering time
 - ✓ Scenario assessment for sustainable rice production systems.

Opportunities to develop joint research on the ground (Madagascar, Senegal and Vietnam) linked to PP (Cirad Platform in partnership) or IJL (IRD International join lab).

For the existing and future joint activities, there is a need to clarify the reporting and M&E procedure for the non CG partners.

Joe Tohme (CIAT DDG4R) stresses the key contribution of French institutions to CIAT Rice program in LAC for several decades.

Bas Bouman (GriSp director) mentions the urgent need to better use the existing expertise within Cirad & IRD. For instance IRRI and AfricaRice have only 1.5 FTE scientists working on rice diseases in Africa versus 20 FTE scientists at Cirad & IRD. Ditto occurs on rain-fed rice. How to capture and use French expertise on this topic and transfer it to Africa or Asia? There is a need to set up funding mechanisms to mobilize this French expertise. He also confirms the need to adapt the accountability framework (technical and financial) to non CG partners.

CRP 3.4 Root, Tubers & Bananas (RTB) (presentation by R. Domaingue, Cirad)

French team (Cirad, Ird & Inra) involved since RTB onset in the programme development. Over 30 (FTE) French scientists could potentially be involved, covering all themes. Strong points: banana and yam research.

Cirad member of Steering and Management Committees and one Cirad scientist (based at Ciat) is leader of Theme 6 (Post harvest technologies...).

Dagmar Wittine (RTB Program Manager) appreciates the French team involvement in the CRP and their current participation in the development of flagship projects. Joe Tohme (Ciat DDG4R) stresses the positive role of IRD to link Colombian universities with RTB as an example of what French partners can do in bridging national partners together with CRPs.

Next steps:

- Preparation of French teams 'action plan by 2014.
- Contribution to construction of remaining Flagships and projects Operational issues

- Strengthen and build better links between CG Centers, French institutions and their partners in the South.
- Engage in common reporting and evaluation of joint projects

CRP 3.5 Grain Legumes (presented by JC Glaszmann, AGAP JRU, Director - Cirad)

Joint activities are a continuation of the Generation Challenge Programme (GCP). Focus on breeding of new groundnut lines incorporating wild introgressions (with Embrapa as a partner) for short-duration, drought-tolerance and aflatoxin-free. Around 3 FTE Cirad scientists involved.

According to Michael Baum (CRP GL director) future collaboration could be extended to improvement of N-fixation into cool season legumes (soya, faba bean) in collaboration with Fabatropinet.

CRP 3.6 Dryland Cereals (presentation by JLG)

Ongoing collaboration (10 FTE French scientists involved) also started with GCP focusing on

- (i) Sorghum improvement in West Africa (led by Cirad) with activities ranging from dynamics of in situ genetic diversity studies to plant modeling, breeding for multi-purpose sweet sorghum (Food- Fuel- Fodder) and grain quality/Grain processing/Nutritional properties
- (ii) Pearl millet (led by IRD) on crop domestication, evolutionary genomics and population genetics analysis of crop adaptation.

Expected future collaboration on: agronomy/post-harvest issues, access to market, development of MARS and BCNAM approaches at regional level, improvement of NP efficiency, drought and flooding tolerance for sorghum.

CRP 3.7 Livestock & Fish (Ph. Lecomte, Cirad, Selmet JRU)

Few linkage with French partners to date.

- ✓ One Cirad fish breeder assigned to WorldFish early 2013.
- ✓ ILRI partner of REVALTER project (Cirad led, funded by French ANR) on “Multi-scale assessment of livestock development pathways in Vietnam”

Potential collaboration with Cirad’s on-going activities on

- ✓ small ruminant Value chain (West Africa)
- ✓ Pig VC (Vietnam)
- ✓ Milk VC (India & Central America)

Thomas Randolph (L&F director) expresses his interest for further discussions on “filières” versus Value-Chain approaches (as already started for activities in Vietnam). In addition, he mentions an

informal consultation made in Nairobi on CG / Cirad-IRD collaboration (driven by Cirad regional Director) which main conclusion is that secondment can be really successful if it is backed by a consistent joint program with agreed objectives. CRPs could really be a framework to achieve this goal.

CRP 5 : Water, Land & Ecosystems (WLE). (presented by Ph. Vernier, Cirad)

- Current joint activities as a continuation of CP Water & Food. Priority regions to continue and expand collaboration are: 1/Volta & Niger basin, 2/Limpopo, 3/ Nile, Mekong.
- Interest to expand collaboration on:
 - ✓ Ecological engineering to maintain and improve the agricultural and environmental functions of agro-ecosystems in relation with Global changes (JRT Eco&Sols)
 - ✓ Links between social and technical management of irrigation systems.

Andrew Noble (WLE Director) reminds participants that there is a long standing collaboration on water management issues between IWMI and French institutions especially IRD. WLE would like to see greater involvement of French teams, on the basis of complementarity and synergy; not only on water issues but on natural resources management in general. He asks for a greater alignment of French institutions with WLE agenda on these topics. Mekong basin could be soon a new zone for a fruitful collaboration.

Other CRPs

Ph. Vernier mentioned that others CRPs could have been included in this meeting agenda but due to the unavailability of their representatives it has not been possible. This is the case of Humidtropics and CCAFS (Climate Change Agriculture & Food security) which are at advanced levels of discussion with French partners for join/coordinated activities, including the secondment of Cirad/IRD scientists.

Preliminary conclusion

P. Caron draws some elements of conclusion:

- ✓ Collaborations in each CRP are at very different stage of development
- ✓ Overall the situation is quite encouraging. A lot of interaction and initiatives are on track including “invisible” actions.
- ✓ CRPs are a good entry points to discuss partnership
- ✓ Need to address the questions raised: clarification of rules and rights for all partners; how to co-engage in larger consortia; how to link with regional programs.
- ✓ Need to think about initiatives for fostering more co-engagement
- ✓ Need to move beyond collaboration in projects to shared vision on objectives and toward joint programming.
- ✓ Address question of joint accountability.

4/ Cross cutting issues (Topics to be discussed): (60 mn)

1. Data Sharing:

Presentation of the current draft of the CGIAR open access Policy by Ed Crothall (Consortium office).

CGIAR regards the results of its activities as international public goods and is therefore committed to their widespread dissemination. CGIAR considers Open Access to be an important practical application of this commitment as it enhances the visibility, accessibility and impact of its research for development activities.

Open Access covers a wide range of information products such as:

- ✓ Scientific and technical publication (reports, journal article, books,..)
- ✓ data and databases;
- ✓ data collection and analysis tools (e.g. models and survey tools);
- ✓ video, audio and images;
- ✓ computer software;
- ✓ web services
- ✓ metadata associated with the information products above.

For Frédéric Lapeyrie (French ministry of Higher education and Research), there are 2 different issues:

Open access, i.e. access to scientific publications. There is a consensus on this and no need to discuss much further.

Open data, i.e. access to primary data produced by research. This issue still raises a lot of discussions, as occurred in the G8 meeting last week. There is no consensus on a global policy about this point.

French research institutions (Inra, Cirad, Ird) are preparing in a joint working group their rules on open data policy. There are still several points and issues under discussions: Which data, embargo rules, IPR, Capacity development (especially in developing countries), ethic & confidentiality, technical questions (DB interoperability), how the benefits will be shared in case of valorization, how to fund the data collection and storage...

Frank Rijsberman indicates that the CGIAR Open data policy will be implemented under the overall IA/IP policy principles & guidelines. Many donors urge the CGIAR to put all its research data in the public domain. To give access to publications is not enough. There is a lot of pressure to make primary research data easily and rapidly (within 6 or 12 months from their production) accessible. This raises the question of “qualified openness”.

2. **Innovation systems** : Proposition of a joint cross-cutting project. introduced by Bernard Triomphe & Daniela Alfaro :

The proposed objective would be to improve the effectiveness of collaborative approaches designed to support agricultural innovation processes and systems in selected “pilot” sites throughout the developing world.

The proposed approach would be to strengthen on-going programs being implemented by selected CRPs by considering relevant adjustments & changes in all phases of innovation development: from the design phase all the way up to the large-scale implementation & dissemination of innovations, and also to the impact assessment.

They propose to adopt a 3-steps approach to develop and formalize this proposal

- ✓ Step 1 (June-Sept 2013): Develop a formal **concept note** and outline the **approach** to be used
- ✓ Step 2 (Sept 2013 - Spring 2014): Develop a **full proposal**.
- ✓ Step 3 (from mid-2014 onwards, over 3-4 years): **Consolidate funding** and **implement initial activities**

A small, gradually expanding task team comprised of selected CIRAD and CRP staff members would be in charge of Step 1 and 2.

3. **Post-doctoral programme & mobility issues:**

Introduction by P. Caron: Cirad proposes to engage together with the Consortium in a joint post-doctoral program, by launching a call for a set of “twin” post-doc positions. The idea is not only to recruit new manpower but to set up mechanisms that create a structuring effect on the CGIAR-Cirad collaboration and to be sure that CRPs’ and Cirad teams really work together. This will be the key criterion to select proposals. Cirad is negotiating with Agropolis foundation to put resources together. Cirad also calls other French institutions to join this initiative. The first call may be published soon, for first recruitments by the end of 2013.

Frank R informs that initially the Consortium planned to set up a post-doctoral program, with a central budget for all CRPs. This system could have aligned with Cirad’s proposal (and other partners interested such as the Netherland, Embrapa,..) but the Fund Council in its last meeting refused to approve it. The revised proposal is that CRPs interested by this Cirad initiative create 2 post-doc positions, one funded by Cirad and the other one by the CRP. In addition the Consortium is working on the harmonization of post doc recruitment conditions within the CGIAR (as a recent survey has shown that conditions are currently very different between CG centers).

4. **How to get access to French training and research programs in the field of agronomic and veterinary sciences:** introduced by C. Hoste, Agreenium). Point of information

Agreenium is a consortium bringing together Higher Education (6 *grandes écoles*) and Research Institutions (INRA & Cirad) to implement actions and programmes linking research, training and development, representing the best that France can offer at the international level in the field of agrosociences.

Agreenium can be used as an access gate to the French higher education system in agrosience with:

- **95** masters of science directly managed, of which **12** “Erasmus Mundus” Master’s courses in cooperation with European universities
- **15** Research Schools
- An “International Research School” (EIR-A)
- **300 research units**
- A mobility programme for young researchers from all over the world: “**AgreenSkills**”
- **Innovative** education methods including individual coaching, e-learning, vocational training
- A virtual university in **agroecology** (under construction)
- Possibility of **double degree** with the home university

5. **Agropolis Fondation**: presentation by Anne Lucie Wack (Agropolis Fondation, Director)

Agropolis Fondation is a financial tool to foster international partnership between our scientific network (a set of research units based in MPL) and international key players in the fields of agricultural and environmental sciences. AF has an annual grant budget of around 3-4 Mn Euro. Since inception 6 years ago, it has committed more than 20 Mns Euros in addition to co-funding with other foundations (CAPES/Brazil, Cariplo/Italy). In every call for proposals launched by the Fondation, collaboration with the CGIAR is encouraged. Since inception, 30 projects involving CG partners have been funded.

The question is how to go beyond this funding mechanism, how to reinforce cooperation through new tools still to be defined jointly (AF/CGIAR)? One could be the co-founding of postdoc positions. Other could be senior/junior fellowships. AF is very open on scientific issues to be targeted (open access, impact assessment, have been mentioned), and is keen to fund innovating and even risking projects (new frontier research).

6. **2014 Family agriculture conference**: (Information by P. Fabre, Cirad)

P. Fabre informs the participants about the organization of an international conference on Family agriculture, to be held on 2nd -4th June 2014, in Montpellier as part of the UN international year of Family Farming. All partners are strongly encouraged to participate and support this event including financially.

5 Overall Conclusion

For Frank Rijsberman, joint programming between the CRPs and IRD/Cirad/Inra may be difficult to obtain since Cirad or IRD and CGIAR are following different business models. The CGIAR system must also recognize that it is not the one and unique partner for Cirad/Ird/Inra. But it is clear that we are moving toward a more collaborative ARD system.

In this context said Frank we need a global agenda with clear objectives where partners can position themselves and indicate how they are taking part. For this, we need a flexible and adapted accountability system where partners bring their own resources to contribute to the common agenda. We need to work further on this idea of “shared accountability” as an alternative to “joint programming”.

For Bernard Hubert (BH) this meeting has been very useful to provide a general overview of collaborative landscape between CGIAR and French Research. The collaboration is rich and the modalities of cooperation are diverse, even if the level of commitment varies between partners. The secondment of scientist is not the only way to work together. The setting-up of a post-doctoral programme is a very interesting tool that can help to strengthen this collaboration and we encourage other institutions (than Cirad) to join it. But we should look beyond CRPs. Capacity strengthening is also building for the future and this cannot be only linked to current programmes. We have to build for 2050 sustainable development goal (SDG), and take advantage of this post-doctoral programme to prepare and select the future researchers that will contribute, in the CGIAR as well as in French research organizations, to worthwhile research topics for the next 30 years. Post-docs are more than a supplement of workforce, it’s an investment in the future!

BH also stresses the link between innovation systems and impact assessment and their importance in the process of change that is needed in agricultural practices to reach SDG/NDG. To conclude, BH thanks everybody for attending and contributing to this meeting, with a special thanks to the colleagues involved in the preparation and organization of this afternoon.

* * * * *